



# Guardian Savings Bank, FSB

Federal Housing Finance Board  
1625 Eye St. NW  
Washington DC 20006

June 20, 2006

Attention: Public Comments

Federal Housing Finance Board Proposed Rule: Excess Stock Restrictions and Retained Earnings Requirements for the Federal Home Loan Banks  
RIN # 3069-AB30  
Docket Number 2006-03

Guardian Savings Bank, F.S.B. is a member of the Federal Home Loan Bank of Cincinnati and the Ohio Bankers League. Our institution relies on the Cincinnati Bank for services and also for a reasonable return on the investment we maintain in Class B stock. We are deeply concerned that the proposed rule is at best unnecessary, and potentially very damaging to the Cincinnati Bank, its mission and our ability to serve our customers. For the reasons which we describe in greater detail below, we respectfully urge the Federal Housing Finance Board (FHFB) to withdraw the proposed rule for further consideration.

The proposed rule can be reduced to four main requirements. The proposal will: 1) Limit the amount of stock the Federal Home Loan Banks may carry, in spite of the fact that it is considered permanent capital under federal law<sup>1</sup>; 2) Prescribe a minimum amount of retained earnings, and doing so in a way that discriminates against and discourages advances borrowings and the successful mortgage purchase programs of the Cincinnati Bank; 3) Limit the payment of dividends; and 4) Preclude the payment of stock dividends, even though Federal law delegates that decision to the local banks. These requirements will be applied in a rigid, one-size-fits-all format, irrespective of the important differences among the various Home Loan Banks. When all four requirements are read together however, it is the inescapable conclusion that the FHFB has a goal of shrinking all of the FHLBanks and programs, including the Bank in Cincinnati.

*The Proposed Rule Will Eliminate the Cincinnati Bank's Voluntary Housing Programs and Greatly Diminish other Mandatory Housing Programs*

Like all other Home Loan Banks, the Cincinnati Bank has a strong commitment to affordable housing. The successful Affordable Housing Program, which has helped nearly 35,000 households in the Cincinnati District, is funded through a 10 percent set-aside of net earnings. This pool of funding will be reduced as profits are reduced. Given the uncertainty over future retained earnings requirements and mandatory capital reductions, the Cincinnati board of directors temporarily suspended two voluntary

---

<sup>1</sup> All of the stock of the Cincinnati Bank is Class B stock, which contains a five year call option.



Mt. Airy Office: 5901 Colerain Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45239 (513) 741-6256 Fax (513) 741-6264  
Branches: Peach Grove, Bridgetown, Cherry Grove, Ft. Wright, Ky., Ft. Thomas, Ky., Florence, Ky., Corporate/Loan

Security Since 1895



housing programs, New Neighbors and the American Dream Homeownership Challenge. The New Neighbors fund for hurricane victims, and the American Dream Homeownership Challenge program for minority and special-needs homebuyers have been used successfully by Ohio banks to help our communities. If the Cincinnati Bank is forced to shrink capital to comply with the proposed rule, resulting in declining profits, it will naturally follow that less funding will be available for these successful housing programs.

*For the Cincinnati Bank, New Rules Enacted in the Name of Safety & Soundness are Simply Not Necessary, and Could Even be Harmful*

The Cincinnati Bank is a conservative, well managed institution that maintains the highest possible rating with both Moody's and Standard & Poor's. Our FHLBank is well-capitalized, successfully operating under a capital plan the FHFBA approved in 2002<sup>2</sup>. We cannot speak for the other FHLBanks, but the new rules you propose in the name of safety and soundness are unnecessary for our Federal Home Loan Bank. Worse, we believe if the proposed rule is enacted in its current form, the financial rating of the Cincinnati FHLBank will be lowered.

The rating of the Cincinnati Bank will likely be lowered for three reasons. First, because excess capital will be redeemed, the Cincinnati FHLB will have less total capital under the proposed rule. It is not relevant to the markets or the rating agencies that the FHLBank's capital account may have a higher percentage of retained earnings. Second, less capital will result in reduced services to my institution. For example, because the rule requires additional capital for non-advance assets, the FHLBank may have to terminate or reduce our mortgage purchase programs. Additionally, the FHLBank may not have the liquidity or flexibility to be able to continue offering same day advances. Thus, if our services are reduced and dividends are slashed and made taxable as a result of the proposed rule, our bank may inevitably choose to redeem additional stock, again lowering overall capital. While this cannot be characterized as a *run* on the Bank's capital account, we find it ironic that preventing accelerated redemptions is one of the stated reasons justifying the proposed rule. In fact, an accelerated redemption is called for by redeeming Excess Stock within 60 days of enactment of this proposed regulation.

Finally, whether it is a policy goal or not, this rule will reduce liquidity. Contrary to the Basel capital debate for banks and thrifts, the Federal Home Loan Banks will be required to hold the same capital for cash and readily marketable securities as for other assets. Given the scarcity of capital, it will simply be too expensive to maintain more than the absolute minimum amount of liquidity.

*The Proposed Rule will Trigger Additional Taxes for the FHLBank Members*

The proposed rule will undermine the careful tax planning of all members of the Federal Home Loan Banks that currently issue stock dividends. First, and most directly our bank believes it is in the best interest of both the Cincinnati FHLBank and all shareholders to

---

<sup>2</sup> For several reasons, the proposed rule will hit the Cincinnati bank harder than the other FHL Banks. One of those reasons is that the proposal does not count cooperative capital. Since cooperative capital benefits all of our shareholders, that should be considered as a positive part of core capital.

issue stock dividends whenever feasible. This policy not only permits the Cincinnati FHLBank to retain the capital to support our housing and advance programs, but also permits shareholders to defer any taxation. Second, if adopted in its current form the rule will require the Cincinnati FHLBank to redeem excess capital as defined in the rule within 60 days. This forced redemption will also force us to realize taxable gains and have an adverse tax impact on my bank.

The tragedy of this is that it will put banks and thrifts yet again at a competitive disadvantage to credit unions. Whether dividends are issued in stock or in cash, these members do not have to pay taxes on the gains. This will be yet another blow to the community banks that are the primary constituents of the Federal Home Loan Banks.

For these reasons, as a shareholder of the Cincinnati Bank, we respectfully request that you withdraw the Proposed Rule.

Sincerely,



William E. Voorhees, Regional Vice President  
Guardian Savings Bank, F.S.B.