

May 1, 2018

Alfred M. Pollard, General Counsel Attention: Comments/RIN 2590-AA83 Federal Housing Finance Agency 400 Seventh Street, SW, Eighth Floor Washington, D.C. 20219



Re: Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and Request for Comments – FICE OF GENERAL COUNSEL RIN 2590-AA83 – Affordable Housing Program Amendments

Mr. Pollard,

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on your recent release of proposed rulemaking regarding the Affordable Housing Program ("AHP") of the Federal Home Loan Banks (FHLBanks). I am presently President and CEO of Breaking Ground, a non-profit headquartered in New York that has previously sponsored AHP projects through FHLBank New York.

Since 2004, FHLB has provided support to nine (9) Breaking Ground developments, enabling us to provide over 3400 units of permanent supportive & affordable housing to low income and formerly homeless households and 146 units of transitional housing to chronically homeless individuals.

Permanent Housing

- The Christopher (opened in 2004) 167 units, plus 40 units for youth aging out of foster care in Manhattan.
- The Schermerhorn (opened in 2009) 217 units in downtown Brooklyn.
- The Brook (in 2010) 190 units in the South Bronx.
- The Lee (project opened in 2010) 207 units, plus 55 units for youth aging out of foster care.
- The Domenech (opened in 2011) 72 units in Brownsville, Brooklyn, exclusively to house formerly homeless and low-income seniors 62 years of age and above.
- Eastman Commons (opened in 2012) 80 units in Rochester, New York.
- The Hegeman (opened in 2012) 161 units in Brownsville, Brooklyn.
- Park House (opened in 2012) 240 units in the South Bronx.

Transitional Housing

• The Andrews (opened in 2009) – 146 units at 160 Bowery in Manhattan. This is the City's single largest safe haven facility.

■1111日 - 111日 - 111日

and a second In the second second

en ander van de stander van de stand New stander van de st New stander van de st

BREAKINGGROUND.ORG · 212.389.9300 · 505 8TH AVENUE, 5TH FLOOR NEW YORK, NY 10018

a di tangan sa siya

n han maarka a baarke a taal amaa barra ka ya kun a ya milaya milaya marke a s

- الا بهمچنین دوری میران کا دانیک ورای دیگری دانیک ایکوی و ایک ایکوی در ایکوی در ایکوی در ایکوی در ایکوی در دانی ایک و از یک دی از ایک دی ایک ایک ایک ایک دیک دیک در ایک در ایک دیک دیک ایک
- and press that we are a set to be an an and the start of the start of the start of the set of the set of the set en al l'anno del marcador a clàra sera a consense sense energianes quals departe energianes seras del sense e i le arrest land and the let all and an include a strategies in the second strategies in the sec And the strength of the source of the strength of the source of the sour
- sing a second statistical designation of the state of the second state of the second state of the second state a (a) Y is a strain of a strain the state of a strain of a strain strain of a strain st When " P. River, the electronic schedulation schedulation states" in the descentions. 1 CA 3 5 1 H 1. 13

e nati	> 21 1년 11일라이는 이용하는 것이	*****	ता विश्व में दुर्धनार	elle per la
		nu je s	* .5 -	A Term
	1. 18 ° 11	4 C		
	ť	1		

¥.

5

17 - 20 - 12 - 40 - 40 a Million States The - 私口教派 (1997年4月 S. M. T. S. DHICK CH.



The proposed Affordable Housing Program Amendments below are of specific concern.

- Outcomes Framework Under the proposed amendments, the outcomes framework may essentially eliminate FHLBank discretion in addressing local housing needs, establish preferences for certain project types and make AHP less transparent.
- Re-ranking Projects The NPR requires that the AHP "re-rank" applications to satisfy the
 outcome requirements if those goals would not be met using only the scoring criteria. This
 poses risks to the core of the program: re-raking is not objective, it is not predicable (for the
 applicants or for the Bank), and it is not transparent. In practice, there may be several cycles of
 re-ranking projects needed to comply with FHFA outcomes because simply substituting one
 project for another may satisfy compliance with one or more FHFA outcome requirements, but
 not all of those requirements. The NPR should revert to using a point structure for scoring
 applications. A point structure gives the FHLBanks more flexibility to address district needs.
- Project Modifications Under the proposed amendments, AHP project modifications may be delayed, and AHP sponsors unduly burdened, due to a new "cure-first" requirement. We recommend that the proposed cure-first requirement be eliminated and the FHLBanks retain their current practice of verifying that any modified project would still have scored high enough in the funding round to receive the AHP award had the sponsor applied for AHP funding with the modifications in place.

We commend FHFA for working to update the AHP regulation. However, in light of the concerns above, we respectfully ask that you reconsider parts of the proposed amendments, especially the required outcomes framework. Thank you for hearing our ideas on this very important subject. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at brosen@breakingground.org.

Sincerely,

ず

Brenda Rosen President and CEO Breaking Ground 505 8th Ave - 5th floor New York, NY 10018

212.389.9300

505 8TH AVENUE, 5TH FLOOR NEW YORK, NY 10018